Three Rivers District Council
Internal Audit Recommendations Log for 26 March 2019 Audit Committee

Appendix 3

Outstanding Recommendations from the 2016/17 Audit Plan

Contract Management 2016/17

Final report issued March 2017

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
01	We recommend that, for each of the four contracts / suppliers selected for testing, there is an examination of the need (as applicable): a) For a formal contract or whether existing arrangements are sufficient for legal and contract management purposes, b) To locate relevant contract documentation where it may exist, and whether any resource expended on this is necessary, or c) To complete and sign any contract documents already in place or whether existing arrangements are sufficient for legal and contract management purposes. d) To re-procure the services to test the market, ensure proper process and provide full documentation with clear	Medium	<u>Capital Constructions, Right Maintenance and Orion Heating:</u> At present for all non-reactive works over £5K, the service is obtaining 3 quotes before the work is commissioned. We agree that a framework or formal agreement should be in place for planned and reactive works and this will require a detailed specification. At present the team is hugely under resourced and this will be a complicated and time consuming specification to produce hence the long target date. The Property Services Team work in accordance with the specification for the PPM contract agreed for each site. Any Contract would be held with Legal. <u>Canon:</u> The Contract Manager has checked with Legal service and they are happy for the contract to continue within the current arrangements. The contract is coming up for renewal in March 2018 and the Contract Manager will ensure	Head of Property	31 December 2017	*	31 March 2018 31 December 2018 30 April 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
	specifications to enable formal signed contracts to be put in place. It is recommended that this is done in conjunction with Legal, the Procurement Manager and the relevant contract owner / manager.		that a signed contract with the new supplier will be maintained. Position (June 2017) Property Services aim to review working arrangements for all Contractor by the end of December. 3 quotes are still obtained for works under £500 to ensure a competitive price is achieved. Works over £5000 will go out to a competitive tender. Position (September 2017) December deadline still stands for the review. Position (November 2017) The team remains hugely under resourced and do not have the capacity to carry out the work to create the specification required. The Head of Property and Major projects has agreed to appoint an external company to write this for us. Revised date 31 March 2018. Position (February 2018) Update to be given by the Head of Property at the meeting on 20 March. Position (July 2018) A specification of construction works is being written and is due to be complete by the end of 2018. Position (September 2018) In progress. Position (November 2018) New Head of Property has been appointed and will progress this issue. The property Team is working with Watford BC to create a robust framework agreement to address the issues. The PPM contract will be going				

Contract Management 2016/17

Final report issued March 2017

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved �× or ✓	Revised Deadline
			through the procurement process before March 2019. **Position (March 2019)** **In progress**				
03	We recommend that: a) Market testing and price benchmarking should be undertaken to confirm that rates / prices being charged are reasonable, b) If appropriate and contracts are put in place, consideration should be given to inclusion of a schedule of rates for the services procured by the authority from each of the suppliers.	Medium	As per recommendation 1 response. Non-reactive works over £5k are awarded after receiving three quotes. However, this will be reviewed as part of the specification. Position (June 2017) To be reviewed by December 2017. Position (September 2017) To be reviewed by December 2017. Position (November 2017) To be reviewed by December 2017. Please see comments at 01. This will be addressed once the specification has been written and the new contract is in place. Position (February 2018) Update to be given by the Head of Property at the meeting on 20 March. Position (July 2018) When the specification as above is complete the works will go to procurement. Position (September 2018) In progress. Position (November 2018) Please see comments at 01 above. Once a framework agreement is in place this will address all the recommendations.	Facilities Manager	31 December 2017	*	31 March 2018 30 April 2019

Contract Management 2016/17							
Final report issued March 2017							
Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved × or ✓	Revised Deadline
			Position (March 2019) **In progress**				

Outstanding Recommendations from the 2017/18 Audit Plan

Cyber Security 2017/18							
Final report issued September 2017							
Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
02	All devices that are running unsupported operating systems should be upgraded to run operating systems that are supported by the developer. Where it is not possible to upgrade the operating system of a device, it must be isolated from the Councils' IT network and appropriate security controls implemented.	High	Agreed – This will be discussed with the relevant IT system owners in order to agree the best way forward to migrate off of legacy operating systems. TRDC XP machines – down to: 2 WBC XP machines – down to: 0 Decommissioning is part of the core infrastructure programme. Since Jan 2017 67 servers have been decommissioned. Position (September 2017) As above – final report only recently issued. Position (November 2017) Significant progress. 96 servers have now been decommissioned. There are 45 remaining with an unsupported operating system installed. All servers have been reviewed and there is an associated plan in place to upgrade and/or decommission. The majority of these services have associated services or impact line of business applications, and need to be upgraded in line with services. TRDC XP machine: 1. This is a system that provides telephone reports. The hardware and OS has been further secured, reducing the risk, by removing all Internet and Email access.	ICT Section Head	30 June 2018	✓	~~31 August 2018~~ 31 December 2018

Cyber Security 2017/18

Final report issued September 2017

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✘ or ✓	Revised Deadline
			Position (February 2018) On track. Further decommissioning / upgrades of servers completed. Position (July 2018) Through the life of the core infrastructure programme over 150 out of support servers have been decommissioned or upgraded. 36 servers has been identified that will remain on an unsupported operating system for the next 6 months to a year, whilst the applications are replaced, upgraded. Plan to move 36 servers to a "walled garden" in place and specifics dependencies identified. PSN (Public Services Network) submission due end of August 2018. Position (September 2018) PSN public services submission completed on time. Awaiting outcome from Cabinet Office. Walled Garden migration underway. Delay to movement of servers has been down to legacy systems with little to no documentation. Internally we have therefore had to map all dependencies across these systems, which has taken additional time and resources. Position (November 2018) Separate report from the ICT Section Head to be presented to Audit Committee on this recommendation. **Position (March 2019)** **All 2003 servers now either decommissioned or within the "Walled Garden."**				

Development Management 2017/18

Final report issued October 2017

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✕ or ✓	Revised Deadline
01	We recommend that a comprehensive manual is produced that includes guidance on all four stages of the application process. The manual should be subject to review every two years, or in the event of significant changes.	Merits Attention	We do have a number of existing manuals / practice notes covering different areas of the DM process. Due to the number of different types of applications we receive there are a number of different requirements so a comprehensive manual is a large document to bring together. In addition we need the support of our CSC as they are now responsible for many of the administrative / validation processes. I would suggest completion of a DM process manual that will cover the different parts of the DM process. Position (November 2017) No update for this committee as final report only recently issued. Position (February 2018) Added to DM E Planning projects list. Work has commenced on reviewing existing manuals in order to establish where amendments/updates required. Also beginning to establish where there are gaps in the process (i.e. where no manual currently exists to cover that part of the process). Position (July 2018) As above. In addition, imminent changes to groupshare folders and how we store documents will result in further assessment and utilisation of existing DM manuals. Position (September 2018) Following appointment to two vacant planning officer posts and completion of work towards other priorities ie GDPR, Officers are now able to turn increased focus to the formulation of a	Team Leader, Development Management	1 April 2018	✕	~~1 October 2018~~ 1 April 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✘ or ✔	Revised Deadline
			procedure manual. Officers have been reviewing the existing manuals which are held by both CSC and DM and cover the varying aspects of the Development Management process from receipt to decision. A working party has been set up to progress this project further. The intention is that Officers will produce an overarching contents sheet to list all aspects of the process with reference to a corresponding manual. As part of the project Officers are also looking to review processes and move towards more electronic working and the procedure manuals will be updated to reflect this. Position (November 2018) In progress. **Position (March 2019)** **Work is well underway on the DM Manuals and they are expected to be completed 1 April 2019. A working group was set up to progress this. A shared folder has been created where all the manuals are stored and from where they can be accessed by all officers. This ensures that all officers are using the same version. There is also an index sheet which lists all manuals, their date, version number etc which can be updated as and when changes are made. DM are continually changing our processes as we move towards more electronic working and are finding that this is meaning that manuals are having to be updated regularly and in addition, new manual requirements are being identified and added.**				

CIL 2017/18

Final report issued May 2018

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
03	Whilst there was no evidence to suggest that the current system does not work, consideration should be given to using Exacom to set reminder dates. This will ensure a more automated system. Reports can also be run on this data, for example to assess resources required in the next few months.		Additional training for CIL Officer to be undertaken to ensure that the Exacom system automatically sets reminder dates. Position (July 2018) CIL Officer attending the CIL Masterclass Training 4 July 2018 Additional training to be organised by the end of the year. Position (September 2018) Additional training to be organised by the end of the year. Position (November 2018) One to one training on Exacom booked in for December 2018. **Position (March 2019)** **Training completed in December 2018.**	Head of Planning Policy & Projects	30 June 2018	✓	31 December 2018

Land Charges 2017/18

Final report issued May 2018

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
01	Create an overarching policy / procedure document for local land charges. This document should include collection, receipting and banking of fees, and the maintenance of the Local Land Charges Register.	Merits Attention	Agreed Position (July 2018) Team given individual responsibility for procedures in their area of expertise as part of their PDR (June/July 2018)	Senior Land and Property Information Officer	1 October 2018	✓	31 March 2019

Land Charges 2017/18

Final report issued May 2018

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
			Position (September 2018) We are behind the target date of 1st October 2018 due to conflicting priorities; particularly affecting the Land and Property Gazetteer. Between now and 1st October 2018 I also have staff resource issues. However, I have asked my Team to allocate some time to this recommendation with a new target of completion of Local Land Charges procedures by the end of the financial year. Position (November 2018) In progress. **Position (March 2019)** **Completed**				

Outstanding Recommendations from the 2018/19 Audit Plan

NDR 2018/19

Final report issued December 2018

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✖ or ✔	Revised Deadline
01	a. NNDR Officers and Inspectors are more proactive in determining the current status of leases and account issues. b. Quarterly inspections are completed on all empty properties. c. Action is taken to obtain confirmation of exact location, verification of mast being in use / not in use or de-commissioned. Upon confirmation of the current status, a decision to be taken on whether an inspection visit or change to account is appropriate.	Medium	To review with much more ease once 'Total Mobile' has been implemented late 2018 / early 2019, which is a new software which enables our 2 Inspectors to download and upload their visits into the Academy software. **Position (March 2019)** **Awaiting implementation of Total Mobile, on target for 31 March 2019 as currently in the testing phase.**	Billing Team Leader	31 March 2019	✖	
02	We recommend that the Billing and Recovery Team Leaders review system reports of all accounts on hold or suppressed, completing spot checks to ensure the reasons are appropriate and where relevant, that timely action is being taken to recover the debt.	Low	Bi-monthly spot checks by Billing & Recovery Team Leaders, which are documented for reasons of holds. **Position (March 2019)** **Started and will be on course covering all recovery notices in sync with Council Tax by deadline date.**	Billing & Recovery Team Leaders	31 March 2019	✖	

NDR 2018/19

Final report issued December 2018

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✕ or ✓	Revised Deadline
03	We recommend that an exercise be undertaken to summarise what 'aged debt' has been deemed unrecoverable and consideration be given to obtaining timely committee approval to write off these debts from previous years.	Low	Agreed **Position (March 2019)** **Write Offs over £3k currently being prepared for both Council's with a view to authorisation before 31 March 2019.**	Revenues Manager	30 June 2019	✕	

Cyber Security 2018/19

Final report issued January 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✕ or ✓	Revised Deadline
01	Management should put a defined plan in place to address all existing critical and high priority vulnerabilities in a timely manner. There should be a defined procedure in place to resolve vulnerabilities as and when they are encountered.	Medium	Update existing procedures to review and remediate vulnerabilities (other than MS patches). If required, implement additional system e.g. SCCM to manage deployment of "other" vulnerabilities. **Position (March 2019)** **Review of products such as SCCM to manage 3rd party patching across the estate.**	ICT Section Head	30 November 2019	✕	
02	There should be a mechanism to restrict any non-complying devices to connect to the Council's IT network. Additionally, there should be	Medium	Review current AV and VPN solution and viability to restrict devices with no up to date protection from connecting to the network fully. Ensure that daily reports for AV protection are monitored against asset register and this is reported to the ICT Section Head.	ICT Section Head	30 September 2019	✕	

Cyber Security 2018/19

Final report issued January 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
	continuous monitoring in place for all devices connected on the network to be fully antivirus protected.		**Position (March 2019)** **Reporting mechanism from Infrastructure monitoring through to desktop services is in place. Mechanism to ensure that desktop services remediate the gaps sufficiently is currently underway.** **Replacement VPN, for all homeworking, is within scope for replacement Wide Area Network. New VPN solution will review ability to ensure that all connected devices have up to date AV.**				
03	A training needs assessment should be performed for all members of staff that have responsibility for Cyber security so as to determine their training needs. Compliance should be monitored and action taken when members of staff are found to have not completed the IT Security and Data Protection training.	Medium	Review current skills against role to assess gap, recommending appropriate training as an outcome. Note funding will have to be approved. HR Manager Monitor and report against all staff who have not completed the annual requirement to refresh knowledge via the Security awareness programme. **Position (March 2019)** **New Learning Management system will be ready approximately April 2019. This is led by the HR service. Once in place more accurate reporting mechanisms can be used to ensure staff are completing the required mandatory training.**	ICT Section Head	30 September 2019 30 June 2019	✗ ✗	

Temporary Accommodation 2018/19

Final report issued February 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
01	We recommend that: • Procedures are produced covering the reconciliation of Housing Benefit payments to temporary accommodation tenant records and validation checks, • A suitable officer within the Housing Supply team is nominated to perform the reconciliation of Housing Benefit payments to temporary accommodation tenant records and validation checks, • Management checks are performed to ensure that Housing Benefit payment schedules have been reviewed in accordance with expectations and evidence is retained and signed-off.	Medium	Procedure to be produced covering housing benefit payment dates but not possible to check the housing benefit payments until new software system in place Housing Supply Officers will undertake this task once the above has been completed. Benefit schedules to be reviewed monthly to confirm dates as above but payments will not be able to be checked until new system in place as above. **Position (March 2019)** **In progress**	Housing Supply Manager	31 August 2019	✗	
02	We recommend that the templates in place for licence agreements and offer letters are amended to include occupancy and rental liability start dates.	Low	Agreed. Action completed. **Position (March 2019)** Implemented	Housing Supply Manager	Implemented December 2018	✓	
03	We recommend that: • Housing Supply Officers are reminded of the requirements of the Temporary Accommodation Sign-up procedure and requirement that states 'when a customer vacates a temporary accommodation property, the	Medium	Agreed. Action completed, email sent to Housing Supply Officers and relevant supervision measures put in place. **Position (March 2019)** Implemented	Housing Supply Manager	Implemented October 2018	✓	

Temporary Accommodation 2018/19

Final report issued February 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
	Housing Supply Team should notify the Council's Debtors and Revenue & Benefits departments by email within one working day. A copy of which should be uploaded to Unity', • Checks are undertaken by a nominated officer at suitable intervals (to be determined by management) to confirm that email notifications have been issued for all temporary accommodation tenants that have vacated, e.g. monthly.		Agreed. Action completed, checks are now completed monthly, commenced in November. **Position (March 2019)** **Implemented**		Implemented November 2018		
04	We fully endorse plans to produce a procedure surrounding the utilisation of Aged Debt reports for current residents of Temporary Accommodation. We recommend that a suitable officer within the Housing Supply team is nominated to receive Aged Debt reports and review debts relating to current residents; We recommend that clarity is sought over the roles and responsibilities of the Housing Supply and Recovery teams to ensure the two-way flow of information is optimal.	Medium	Housing Supply Manager to develop a procedure in partnership with the Recovery Team Leader. These go to the Housing Supply Officers, copied into Housing Supply Manager, for action. **Position (March 2019)** **Meeting held with the Recovery Team and my counterpart at Watford Borough Council to discuss their processes.** **I discussed the roles and responsibilities with our Recovery Team and I would be in a position to draft a procedure using the Aged Debt reports, however there are parts of Watford's processes that I would like to incorporate into our own if practical and this will take longer to complete.**	Housing Supply Manager	31 January 2019 Implemented	✗	30 April 2019

Council Tax 2018/19

Final report issued February 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
01	We recommend that a control is put in place to ensure that the 'Return of Death' reports are actioned in a timely manner.	Low	Agreed **Position (March 2019)** **Billing Team Leader distributes daily / weekly once received.**	Billing Team Leader	Immediate	✓	
02	As previously recommended in the 2017/18 Council Tax audit : a. Staff should be reminded to enter review and provisional end dates for Student Exemptions. b. An exercise should be performed to check existing Student Exemptions cases to ensure that dates are in place. This review should be undertaken annually in future.	Medium	Billing Team Leader on a quarterly basis. **Position (March 2019)** **Billing Team Leader received training week commencing 11 February 2019, and deadline will be met whilst also reviewing on a quarterly basis.**	Billing Team Leader	31 March 2019	✗	
03	We recommend that: a. inspections on second homes are completed and further action taken if found unfurnished and /or unlikely to be used as a second home. b. The Revenues Manager completes the review of empty properties within the identified parish boundary changes and ensures appropriate action is taken. c. Action is taken to determine the current status on the property Left Empty by Deceased with no charge made since 05/07/2016.	Low	Once Total Mobile up and running to be added to parameters. Go Live date mid-February, 2019. **Position (March 2019)** **Awaiting implementation of Total Mobile, on target for 31 March 2019 as currently in the testing phase.**	Billing Team Leader	31 March 2019	✗	

Council Tax 2018/19

Final report issued February 2019

Ref No.	Recommendation	Priority	Action to Date	Responsibility	Deadline	Resolved ✗ or ✓	Revised Deadline
04	We recommend that Team Leaders review system reports of all accounts on hold or suppressed, completing spot checks to ensure the reasons are appropriate and where relevant, that timely action is being taken to recover the debt.	Low	Agreed **Position (March 2019)** **Completed**	Recovery & Billing Team Leaders	28 February 2019	✓	
05	We recommend an exercise is undertaken to summarise what 'aged debt' has been deemed irrecoverable and consideration be given to obtaining timely committee approval to write off these debts from previous years.	Low	The aged debt analysis is not all related to write offs, some of the outstanding monies highlighted are at different recovery enforcement stages, i.e., currently in arrangements or with our Enforcement Agents (Bailiffs) for collection, therefore reducing the amount to be proposed for write off at the date of statistical analysis. This will also apply to the same recommendation made in the NDR Final Report issued 20 December 2018. **Position (March 2019)** **Head of Service currently on sickness, however, meeting arranged for 27.03.19, hopefully sooner to discuss recommendation exercise.**	Revenues Manager	31 March 2019	✗	30 June 2019